

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:16-cv-01256-EGS**

AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION et al v. CENTRAL
INTELLIGENCE AGENCY et al

Assigned to: Judge Emmet G. Sullivan

Case: 1:18-cv-01129-EGS

Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 06/21/2016

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

**AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES
UNION**

represented by **Ramya Krishnan**
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302
New York, NY 10115
(646) 745-8500
Email: ramya.krishnan@knightcolumbia.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alexander Abraham Abdo
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302
New York, NY 10115
(646) 745-8500
Email: alex.abdo@knightcolumbia.org
PRO HAC VICE

Benjamin Robert Good
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor
New York, NY 10004
(212) 549-2500
Fax: (212) 549-2654
Email: bgood@aclu.org
TERMINATED: 08/31/2016

Brett Max Kaufman
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION
125 Broad Street
18th Floor
New York, NY 10004
(212) 549-2603
Fax: (212) 549-2654
Email: bkaufman@aclu.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jameel Jaffer
KNIGHT FIRST AMENDMENT
INSTITUTE AT COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY
475 Riverside Drive
Suite 302

New York, NY 10115
(646) 745-8500
Email: jameel.jaffer@knightcolumbia.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Arthur B. Spitzer
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
915 15th Street, NW
2nd Floor
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 601-4266
Fax: (202) 457-0805
Email: artspitzer@gmail.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

**AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES
UNION FOUNDATION**

represented by **Ramya Krishnan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alexander Abraham Abdo
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE

Benjamin Robert Good
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/31/2016

Brett Max Kaufman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jameel Jaffer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Arthur B. Spitzer
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE
AGENCY**
Washington, DC 20505

represented by **Antonia Marie Konkoly**
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
1100 L Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 514-2395
Fax: (202) 616-8470
Email: antonia.konkoly@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tamra Tyree Moore
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
1100 L Street, NW
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 305-8628

Fax: (202) 616-8460
Email: tamra.moore@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
P.O. Box 883, Benjamin Franklin Station
Washington, DC 20044
(202) 514-4336
Fax: (202) 616-8202
Email: ryan.parker@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

Defendant

DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE

represented by **Antonia Marie Konkoly**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tamra Tyree Moore
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

Defendant

DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY

represented by **DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY**
PRO SE

Tamra Tyree Moore
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

Defendant

**DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND
SECURITY**

represented by **Antonia Marie Konkoly**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tamra Tyree Moore
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

Defendant

DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

represented by **Antonia Marie Konkoly**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tamra Tyree Moore
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

Defendant

DEPARTMENT OF STATE

represented by **Antonia Marie Konkoly**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tamra Tyree Moore
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

Defendant

**DEPARTMENT OF THE
TREASURY**

represented by **Antonia Marie Konkoly**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tamra Tyree Moore
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

Defendant

**OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF
NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE**

represented by **Antonia Marie Konkoly**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tamra Tyree Moore
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/24/2019
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ryan Bradley Parker
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/01/2018

| Date Filed | # | Docket Text |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 06/21/2016 | <u>1</u> | COMPLAINT against CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0090-4576095) filed by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>2</u> Rule 7.1 Disclosure, # <u>3</u> Summons, # <u>4</u> Summons, # <u>5</u> Summons, # <u>6</u> Summons, # <u>7</u> Summons, # <u>8</u> Summons, # <u>9</u> Summons, # <u>10</u> Summons)(Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 06/21/2016) |
| 06/21/2016 | <u>2</u> | LCvR 7.1 CERTIFICATE OF DISCLOSURE of Corporate Affiliations and Financial Interests by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION. (md) (Entered: 06/21/2016) |
| 06/21/2016 | | Case Assigned to Judge Emmet G. Sullivan. (md) (Entered: 06/21/2016) |
| 06/22/2016 | <u>3</u> | SUMMONS (10) Issued Electronically as to CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice of Consent) (md) (Entered: 06/22/2016) |
| 06/28/2016 | <u>4</u> | MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Benjamin Robert Good, :Firm- American Civil Liberties Union Foundation, :Address- 125 Broad Street, 18th Floor, New York, NY 10004. Phone No. - 212-549-2500. Fax No. - 212-549-2654 Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090-4584776. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION (Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 06/28/2016) |
| 06/28/2016 | <u>5</u> | MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name- Brett Max Kaufman, :Firm- American Civil Liberties Union Foundation, :Address- 125 Broad Street, 18th Floor, New York, NY 10004. Phone No. - 212-549-2500. Fax No. - 212-548-2654 Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090-4584784. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION (Spitzer, Arthur) (Entered: 06/28/2016) |
| 06/29/2016 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>4</u> motion for leave to appear pro hac vice. Benjamin Robert Good is hereby admitted pro hac vice in this matter. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on June 29, 2016. (lcegs3) (Entered: 06/29/2016) |
| 06/29/2016 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>5</u> motion for leave to appear pro hac vice. Brett Max Kaufman is hereby admitted pro hac vice in this matter. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on June 29, 2016. (lcegs3) (Entered: 06/29/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>6</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed as to the United States Attorney. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney on 7/6/2016. Answer due for ALL FEDERAL DEFENDANTS by 8/5/2016. (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>7</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed on United States Attorney General. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney General July 5, 2016. (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>8</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE served on 7/5/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>9</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY served on 7/5/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>10</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. DEPARTMENT OF STATE served on 7/5/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 07/22/2016 | <u>11</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE served on 7/6/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>12</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY served on 7/5/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>13</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE served on 7/5/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>14</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY served on 7/5/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/22/2016 | <u>15</u> | RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY served on 7/5/2016 (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/22/2016) |
| 07/26/2016 | <u>16</u> | Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Responsive Pleading</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 07/26/2016) |
| 07/27/2016 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>16</u> defendant's unopposed motion for extension of time. Defendants shall answer, or otherwise respond to plaintiffs' complaint, by no later than September 7, 2016. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on July 27, 2016. (lcegs3) (Entered: 07/27/2016) |
| 07/27/2016 | | Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Answer or other response due by 9/7/2016. (cdw) (Entered: 07/28/2016) |
| 08/01/2016 | <u>17</u> | REQUEST FOR SUMMONS TO ISSUE filed by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION.(Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 08/01/2016) |
| 08/02/2016 | <u>18</u> | SUMMONS Issued Electronically as to DEPARTMENT OF STATE. (jf) (Entered: 08/02/2016) |
| 08/31/2016 | <u>19</u> | NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION. Attorney Benjamin Robert Good terminated. (Good, Benjamin) (Entered: 08/31/2016) |
| 09/07/2016 | <u>20</u> | ANSWER to Complaint by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE.(Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 09/07/2016) |
| 09/30/2016 | <u>21</u> | STANDING ORDER. The parties are directed to read this Order in its entirety upon receipt. The parties shall file a proposed schedule for future proceedings by no later than October 7, 2016. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 09/30/2016. (lcegs3) (Entered: 09/30/2016) |
| 10/03/2016 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Scheduling Order For Further Proceedings due by 10/7/2016. (mac) (Entered: 10/03/2016) |
| 10/04/2016 | <u>22</u> | Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File a Proposed Schedule for Future Proceedings</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 10/04/2016) |
| 10/04/2016 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>22</u> joint motion for an extension of time to file a proposed scheduling order. The parties shall file their proposed scheduling order by no later than November 4, 2016. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 10/4/2016. (lcegs3) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| | | (Entered: 10/04/2016) |
| 10/04/2016 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Proposed Scheduling Order due by 11/4/2016. (mac) (Entered: 10/04/2016) |
| 11/04/2016 | <u>23</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE re <u>21</u> Order <i>Directing Parties to File a Joint Proposed Scheduling Order</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 11/04/2016) |
| 11/07/2016 | | MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the parties' joint proposed scheduling order, the parties are directed to file another joint proposed scheduling order by no later than April 7, 2017. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 11/7/2016. (lcegs3) (Entered: 11/07/2016) |
| 11/07/2016 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Proposed Scheduling Order due by 4/7/2017. (mac) (Entered: 11/07/2016) |
| 02/23/2017 | <u>24</u> | MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name– Alex Abdo, :Firm– Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University, :Address– 535 West 116th Street, Low Library, New York, New York 10027. Phone No. – 212–854–1128. Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090–4852480. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Kaufman, Brett) (Entered: 02/23/2017) |
| 02/23/2017 | <u>25</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Jameel Jaffer on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 02/23/2017) |
| 02/23/2017 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>24</u> motion for admission pro hac vice. Alex Abdo is hereby admitted pro hac vice in this action. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 02/23/2017. (lcegs3) (Entered: 02/23/2017) |
| 04/07/2017 | <u>26</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE re Order <i>Directing Parties to File a Joint Proposed Scheduling Order</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 04/07/2017) |
| 04/10/2017 | | MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the parties' joint proposed scheduling order, the parties are directed to file another joint proposed scheduling order by no later than June 24, 2017. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 04/10/2017. (lcegs3) (Entered: 04/10/2017) |
| 04/10/2017 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Scheduling Order due by 6/24/2017. (mac) (Entered: 04/10/2017) |
| 06/23/2017 | <u>27</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 06/23/2017) |
| 06/26/2017 | | MINUTE ORDER. In view of <u>27</u> the parties' Joint Proposed Scheduling Order, the parties are ORDERED to file another joint proposed scheduling order by no later than August 25, 2017 to update the Court on the status of defendants' productions and whether further litigation will be necessary. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 06/26/2017. (lcegs3) (Entered: 06/26/2017) |
| 06/27/2017 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Scheduling Order due by 8/25/2017. (mac) (Entered: 06/27/2017) |
| 08/24/2017 | <u>28</u> | STIPULATION of Dismissal of <i>Several Agencies and Components</i> by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION. (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 08/24/2017) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 08/25/2017 | <u>29</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 08/25/2017) |
| 08/28/2017 | | MINUTE ORDER. In view of <u>29</u> the parties' Joint Proposed Scheduling Order, the parties are ORDERED to file another joint proposed scheduling order by no later than October 20, 2017. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 8/28/2017.(lcegs3) (Entered: 08/28/2017) |
| 08/28/2017 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Scheduling Order due by 10/20/2017. (mac) (Entered: 08/28/2017) |
| 10/20/2017 | <u>30</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 10/20/2017) |
| 10/20/2017 | | MINUTE ORDER In view of <u>30</u> the parties' Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule, the parties are ORDERED to file another joint proposed briefing schedule by no later than December 15, 2017 to update the Court on the status of defendants' productions and whether further litigation will be necessary. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 10/20/2017. (lcegs3) (Entered: 10/20/2017) |
| 10/23/2017 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule due by 12/15/2017. (mac) (Entered: 10/23/2017) |
| 12/13/2017 | <u>31</u> | Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 12/13/2017) |
| 12/14/2017 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>31</u> consent motion for extension of time to file joint proposed briefing schedule. Parties shall therefore file a joint proposed briefing schedule by December 22, 2017. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 12/14/2017. (lcegs3) (Entered: 12/14/2017) |
| 12/14/2017 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule due by 12/22/2017. (mac) (Entered: 12/14/2017) |
| 12/22/2017 | <u>32</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 12/22/2017) |
| 01/02/2018 | 33 | MINUTE ORDER in view of <u>32</u> , joint proposed briefing schedule, the parties are ordered to file another joint proposed briefing schedule by February 23, 2018 to update the Court on the status of defendants' productions and whether further litigation will be necessary. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 1/2/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 01/02/2018) |
| 01/03/2018 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule due by 2/23/2018. (mac) (Entered: 01/03/2018) |
| 01/31/2018 | <u>34</u> | NOTICE of Change of Address by Alexander Abraham Abdo (Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 01/31/2018) |
| 02/23/2018 | <u>35</u> | Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 02/23/2018) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 02/26/2018 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>35</u> joint motion for extension of time to file joint proposed briefing schedule. The parties shall therefore file their joint proposed briefing schedule by March 9, 2018. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 2/26/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 02/26/2018) |
| 02/26/2018 | | Set/Reset DeadlinesJoint Proposed Briefing Schedule due by 3/9/2018. (mac) (Entered: 02/26/2018) |
| 03/09/2018 | <u>36</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 03/09/2018) |
| 03/13/2018 | | MINUTE ORDER in view of <u>36</u> joint proposed briefing schedule, the parties are ordered to file another joint proposed briefing schedule by May 18, 2018 to update the Court on the status of defendants' productions and whether further litigation will be necessary. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 3/13/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 03/13/2018) |
| 03/13/2018 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule due by 5/18/2018 (mac) (Entered: 03/13/2018) |
| 05/18/2018 | <u>37</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Parker, Ryan) (Entered: 05/18/2018) |
| 05/21/2018 | | MINUTE ORDER in view of <u>37</u> joint proposed briefing schedule, the parties are directed to file another joint proposed scheduling order by August 10, 2018 to update the Court on the status of defendants' productions and whether further litigation will be necessary. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 5/21/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 05/21/2018) |
| 05/22/2018 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Scheduling Order due by 8/10/2018. (mac) (Entered: 05/22/2018) |
| 06/01/2018 | <u>38</u> | NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Tamra Tyree Moore on behalf of All Defendants Substituting for attorney Ryan Bradley Parker (Moore, Tamra) (Entered: 06/01/2018) |
| 08/10/2018 | <u>39</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Moore, Tamra) (Entered: 08/10/2018) |
| 08/13/2018 | | MINUTE ORDER in view of <u>39</u> proposed briefing schedule, in which the parties state that they are working toward resolution of the case, the parties are directed to file another joint proposed scheduling order by September 21, 2018 to update the Court on whether further litigation will be necessary. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 8/13/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 08/13/2018) |
| 08/14/2018 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Proposed Scheduling Order due by 9/21/2018. (mac) (Entered: 08/14/2018) |
| 09/21/2018 | <u>40</u> | Joint Proposed Scheduling Order by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Moore, Tamra) Modified on 9/24/2018 to correct docket text (jf). (Entered: 09/21/2018) |
| 09/24/2018 | | MINUTE ORDER in view of <u>40</u> joint proposed scheduling order, the parties are directed to file another joint status report by no later than November 30, 2018 to update the Court as to whether further litigation will be necessary. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 9/24/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 09/24/2018) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 09/25/2018 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 11/30/2018. (mac) (Entered: 09/25/2018) |
| 11/30/2018 | <u>41</u> | Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Joint Status Report</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Moore, Tamra) (Entered: 11/30/2018) |
| 12/03/2018 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>41</u> defendants' consent motion for extension of time to file joint status report. The parties shall therefore file a joint status report by December 10, 2018. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 12/3/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 12/03/2018) |
| 12/04/2018 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 12/10/2018. (mac) (Entered: 12/04/2018) |
| 12/10/2018 | <u>42</u> | Joint STATUS REPORT by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Moore, Tamra) (Entered: 12/10/2018) |
| 12/11/2018 | | MINUTE ORDER. In view of <u>42</u> joint status report, the parties are directed to file another joint status report by January 25, 2019 updating the Court as to whether further litigation will be necessary and proposing a briefing schedule, if appropriate. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 12/11/2018. (lcegs3) (Entered: 12/11/2018) |
| 12/12/2018 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 1/25/2019. (mac) (Entered: 12/12/2018) |
| 01/25/2019 | <u>43</u> | Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Joint Status Report</i> by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Kaufman, Brett) (Entered: 01/25/2019) |
| 01/25/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>43</u> joint motion for extension of time to file joint status report. The parties are directed to file another joint status report by no later than February 11, 2019 updating the Court as to whether further litigation will be necessary and proposing a briefing schedule, if appropriate. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 1/25/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 01/25/2019) |
| 01/28/2019 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 2/11/2019. (mac) (Entered: 01/28/2019) |
| 01/28/2019 | <u>44</u> | NOTICE <i>to the Court of Restoration of Appropriations</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE re Order on Motion for Extension of Time to File, (Moore, Tamra) (Entered: 01/28/2019) |
| 02/11/2019 | <u>45</u> | Joint Proposed Scheduling Order by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Moore, Tamra) Modified on 2/12/2019 to correct docket text (jf). (Entered: 02/11/2019) |
| 02/12/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER. In view of the <u>45</u> Joint Proposed Scheduling Order, the parties are directed to file a joint status report by no later than July 26, 2019, updating the Court on the status of Defendants' responses to Plaintiffs' FOIA requests and proposing a schedule for further proceedings. The Court declines to adopt Plaintiffs' proposed bifurcated summary judgment briefing schedule substantially for the reasons set forth in Defendants' proposal. See Joint Proposed Scheduling Order, ECF No. 45 at 9–10. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 2/12/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 02/12/2019) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 02/12/2019 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 7/26/2019. (mac) (Entered: 02/12/2019) |
| 05/03/2019 | <u>46</u> | STANDING ORDER: The parties are directed to read the attached Standing Order Governing Civil Cases Before Judge Emmet G. Sullivan in its entirety upon receipt. The parties are hereby ORDERED to comply with the directives in the attached Standing Order. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 05/03/19. (Attachment: Exhibit 1) (mac) (Entered: 05/03/2019) |
| 05/24/2019 | <u>47</u> | MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice :Attorney Name– Ramya Krishnan, :Firm– Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University, :Address– ramya.krishnan@knightcolumbia.org. Phone No. – 6467458500. Filing fee \$ 100, receipt number 0090–6144907. Fee Status: Fee Paid. by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 05/24/2019) |
| 05/28/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER granting <u>47</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice. The Court hereby grants Ramya Krishnan pro hac vice admission to this Court pursuant to Local Civil Rule 83.2. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 5/28/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 05/28/2019) |
| 07/24/2019 | <u>48</u> | NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Antonia Marie Konkoly on behalf of CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE Substituting for attorney Tamra Moore (Konkoly, Antonia) (Entered: 07/24/2019) |
| 07/26/2019 | <u>49</u> | Joint STATUS REPORT <i>and Proposed Schedule for Further Proceedings</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Konkoly, Antonia) (Entered: 07/26/2019) |
| 07/29/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER. In view of the <u>49</u> Joint Status Report, Plaintiffs shall communicate all issues and withholdings they plan to challenge to Defendants by no later than July 31, 2019. The parties are directed to meet and confer, and file a further joint status report by no later than August 7, 2019, proposing a schedule for dispositive motions. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 7/29/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 07/29/2019) |
| 07/29/2019 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Further Joint Status Report due by 8/7/2019. (mac) (Entered: 07/29/2019) |
| 08/07/2019 | <u>50</u> | Joint STATUS REPORT <i>With Proposed Briefing Schedule</i> by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, DEPARTMENT OF STATE, DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY, OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Konkoly, Antonia) (Entered: 08/07/2019) |
| 08/08/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the parties' <u>50</u> Joint Status Report with Proposed Briefing Schedule, the parties shall adhere to the following briefing schedule: (1) Defendant Central Intelligence Agency ("CIA") shall file its motion for summary judgment by no later than September 12, 2019; (2) Plaintiffs shall file their cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than October 10, 2019; (3) the CIA shall file a single memorandum containing its reply arguments in support of its motion and in opposition to Plaintiffs' motion by no later than October 31, 2019; and (4) Plaintiffs shall file a reply memorandum in support of their motion by no later than November 14, 2019. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 8/8/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 08/08/2019) |
| 08/15/2019 | <u>51</u> | STIPULATION of Dismissal <i>of Several Agencies and Components</i> by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 08/15/2019) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 08/19/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER. In view of the <u>51</u> Joint Stipulation of Dismissal of Several Agencies and Components, Defendants Central Intelligence Agency and the Air Force are the remaining defendants in this action. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 41(a)(1)(A)(ii), Plaintiffs voluntarily dismissed with prejudice their claims against the following nine Defendants: (1) Defense Intelligence Agency; (2) Department of Homeland Security; (3) Department of State; (4) Department of Treasury; (5) Federal Bureau of Investigation; (6) National Reconnaissance Office; (7) National Security Agency; (8) Navy; and (9) Office of the Director of National Intelligence. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 8/19/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 08/19/2019) |
| 09/12/2019 | <u>52</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Antoinette B. Shiner, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>6</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>7</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Konkoly, Antonia) (Entered: 09/12/2019) |
| 09/13/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER denying without prejudice <u>52</u> Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment for failure to comply with paragraph 13 of the Court's Standing Order, ECF No. <u>46</u> at 8–10. Plaintiffs' deadline to respond to Defendant's motion is hereby VACATED. The parties are directed to submit a joint proposed briefing schedule by no later than September 27, 2019. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 9/13/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 09/13/2019) |
| 09/16/2019 | <u>53</u> | PROPOSED BRIEFING SCHEDULE (<i>Joint</i>) by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Konkoly, Antonia) (Entered: 09/16/2019) |
| 09/18/2019 | | MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the <u>53</u> Joint Proposed Briefing Schedule, the parties shall adhere to the following briefing schedule: (1) Defendant Central Intelligence Agency ("CIA") shall re–file its motion for summary judgment by no later than September 20, 2019; (2) Plaintiffs shall file their cross–motion for summary judgment by no later than October 10, 2019; (3) the CIA shall file a single memorandum containing its reply arguments in support of its motion and in opposition to Plaintiffs' motion by no later than October 31, 2019; and (4) Plaintiffs shall file a reply memorandum in support of their motion by no later than November 14, 2019. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on 9/18/2019. (lcegs3) (Entered: 09/18/2019) |
| 09/18/2019 | <u>54</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Corrected</i>) by CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Antoinette B. Shiner, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>6</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>7</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Konkoly, Antonia) (Entered: 09/18/2019) |
| 09/19/2019 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: CIA To Re–File Its Motion For Summary Judgment due by 9/20/2019. Plaintiff Cross–Motion For Summary Judgment due by 10/10/2019. CIA Single Memorandum Containing Its Reply Arguments In Support Of Its Motion And In Opposition due by 10/31/2019. Plaintiffs Reply Memorandum In Support Of Their Motion due by 11/14/2019. (mac) (Entered: 09/19/2019) |
| 10/10/2019 | <u>55</u> | Cross MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Ramya Krishnan, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A to I, # <u>4</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>5</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Krishnan, Ramya) Modified on 10/11/2019 to correct docket text (jf). (Entered: 10/10/2019) |
| 10/11/2019 | | NOTICE OF ERROR re <u>55</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment; emailed to ramya.krishnan@knightcolumbia.org, cc'd 14 associated attorneys — The PDF file you docketed contained errors: 1. Two–part docket entry, 2. Please refile document, 3. using the OPPOSITION event (zjf,) (Entered: 10/11/2019) |
| 10/11/2019 | <u>56</u> | Memorandum in opposition to re <u>54</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Corrected</i>) filed by AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION, AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Ramya Krishnan, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A to I, # <u>4</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>5</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Krishnan, Ramya) (Entered: 10/11/2019) |